

APPROVED



**SCOTTSDALE HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION
PINNACLE TRAINING ROOM
7575 EAST MAIN STREET
SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA 85251
MONDAY, MAY 10, 2004**

MINUTES

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: John Tutelman, Chair
Ken Culver, Vice Chair
Carol Padwe, Commissioner
Enid Seiden, Commissioner
Aubrey Strickstein, Commissioner
Ted Tyler, Commissioner

ABSENT: Marty Gendron, Commissioner

STAFF PRESENT: Velicia McMillan, Staff Liaison

OTHERS PRESENT FOR ALL OR PORTIONS OF THE MEETING:

Patrick Kelly
Rita Koppinger
Jennifer Twitchell

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Tutelman called the meeting to order at 5:08 p.m.

ROLL CALL

A formal roll call confirmed members present as stated above.

PRESENTATION ON SERVICE PROVIDED TO NATIVE AMERICAN COMMUNITY

Commissioner Tyler introduced Vista Del Camino Director, Ms. Rita Kippinger. He noted that she does a wonderful job and it is a wonderful Center.

Ms. Koppinger provided information on the Yaqui's history in Scottsdale. She reported 215 Yaquis live in Scottsdale.

She provided an overview of the services and programs provided to the Yaqui Community. She explained that one of the goals of Vista del Camino is to bring services to the Yaqui community. They sat down and had a brainstorming session on ways to bring recognition and raise awareness of Yaqui presence in the community as a treasure to our city. They came up with a mural art project. She reported that a well know Yaqui artist also participated. She further reported that there is a "Wellbriety" movement with a vision for raising a generation of drug and alcohol free youth. She noted that one of the Yaqui concepts is "a good heart" which means to make sure you have looked into your heart before making a decision

She stated they are starting a Community Coalition to develop a long-range plan that would focus on better housing, education, and leadership for young people. She discussed the book "The Yaquis of Scottsdale Arizona" that tells the stories of many of the Yaqui people in the community.

Commissioner Strickstein inquired if the Human Relations Commission should be aware of any community tension with the different Indian communities within Scottsdale. Ms. Koppinger replied that she was not aware of any tension. She noted that the Police Department has been working closely with them to have more presence in the community.

Commissioner Tyler inquired if unemployment is a problem. Ms. Koppinger replied in the affirmative. She added that substance abuse is also one of the problems that they are trying to deal with.

Commissioner Seiden inquired if the youth are going into the working world and trying to become part of society. Ms. Koppinger replied they are seeing a lot of youth going into the working world noting that quite a few Yaqui's are employed by the City of Scottsdale. She further noted that they hold all kinds of positions in the Valley.

REPORT ON STATUS OF ALLEGED HATE CRIMES

Dr. McMillan explained that she received a phone call from Chief Rodbell at 2:30 this afternoon and apologized that he and Detective Nichols would not be able to attend this meeting. She reported that Chief Rodbell advised her that this incident had been classified as a hate crime and explained what took so long was that the investigation

started under mitigating circumstances. She reported the suspect has been identified and arrangements are being made to pick him up. She reported that Chief Rodbell and Detective Nichols would be at the next meeting.

Jennifer Twitchell, Anti Defamation League, inquired about how long this incident has been classified as a hate crime. Vice Chair Culver replied 10 days.

Patrick Kelly, Gay & Lesbian Chamber of Commerce, inquired if that report was available to the general public. Vice Chair Culver stated that the general public has a 10 day waiting period. He further stated as long as the investigation is ongoing the report cannot be released. Dr. McMillan stated if Mr. Kelly left his business card, she would provide him with a copy of that report.

Dr. McMillan explained that the Commission does have the authority to call a special meeting if they want to discuss this issue prior to the June meeting.

Chair Tutelman stated that he attended a US Attorney Hate Crime working group and learned from a City of Phoenix prosecutor about an incident that occurred in Scottsdale on February 16, 2003 at 2:00 a.m. He provided a brief overview of the incident where several kids came over to another kid's house, assaulted him, and caused \$200 worth of damages. He further stated that apparently the Scottsdale Police Department declined to take a report. He reported the City of Phoenix Police Department managed to track down the suspect and put together enough of a report where the Defendant came in and plead guilty. Dr. McMillan remarked that it was her understanding that some racial epithets were used during the conversation. Chair Tutelman stated regardless of whether this was a hate crime it was a lousy investigation.

Vice Chair Culver stated that there have been incidents that have occurred at his house, and an incident where they broke into his van and stole a \$25,000 bike. And when he reported it to the police as a possible hate crime because of who he is and that fact did not seem to matter. Dr. McMillan stated she felt there are several issues training, accountability and a lack of checks and balances. The person conducting the investigation should have the proper training to conduct the investigation.

Commissioner Tyler suggested since they do not have representation from the Police Department that they are just talking to themselves so he would suggest they wait to have this discussion.

Dr. McMillan reported that she has been working with the City of Phoenix to add Scottsdale as part of the grant that would provide training to police officers on racial profiling. She further reported that the training was to begin in April but the proposal did not have the correct statistical analysis. The intent is to provide that training in August. She further reported that another component would be to hold forums for the community so our residents become trained on racial profiling.

Commissioner Strickstein stated that he felt training was not the only solution they also need to have performance measures and they have to be held accountable for their behaviors.

Ms. Twitchell reported that there is a statewide problem regarding reporting violent crimes and hate crimes because that information can be detrimental to the tourist industry and people wanting to work and live in our city.

Vice Chair Culver explained that a year and a half ago there was an incident in a club regarding a gay gentleman and the investigation into whether it was a hate crime went from person to person and the process was difficult. Chair Tutelman remarked that he felt the first officer on the scene should have the power to say this is a hate crime. He further remarked that there have been several other incidents the Commission has reviewed that he felt should have been classified as hate crimes that were not. He noted that with the new Police Chief there seems to be more commitment.

Vice Chair Culver stated that his biggest concern with the most recent incident is that the Police have not picked this gentleman up. Chair Tutelman stated he would assume that will be addressed at the next meeting.

Mr. Kelly inquired if the City of Scottsdale Police Department has a definition or policy of what is a hate crime. Chair Tutelman replied there is a federal definition that all local agencies follow.

Mr. Kelly stated that he is a citizen of Scottsdale and he wants this Commission to understand that hate crimes are a serious issue. He further stated that he sent an email to the Mayor and City Council members' regarding the fact that he does not want this issue swept under the rug. He inquired why are there not representatives here from the Police Department to address this recent incident. Dr. McMillan explained that she received a phone call from the Chief that he and Detective Nichols could not make it to this meeting and apologized stating that they will be here next month. Commissioner Tyler noted that his knowledge of Chief Rodbell is that he is a man of integrity and if he is not here, he has a reason for it. He further noted that he will approach this straight on and not cover up anything because it might be adverse to tourism.

Commissioner Padwe moved that the Scottsdale Human Relations Commission hold a special meeting to receive a report on the status of alleged hate crimes. Second by Commission Strickstein.

Vice Chair Culver commented about the fact that he has more comfort with what is currently being done rather how it has been done in the past. The officers working with hate crimes are excellent men and the Police Department is heading in the right direction. Ms. Twitchell stated she would agree.

Dr. McMillan reported that they need to choose a date for the special meeting and determine what questions they would like to ask.

Commissioner Strickstein asked the two guests from their vantagepoint what should the Commission be more sensitive to when working with the communities they represent. Ms. Twitchell replied they would like to see more hate crime legislation and hate crime training. Training the officers to realize what might be a hate crime. She noted that she felt the community also needs to be able to identify a hate crime. The children also need to be taught about hate crimes. Opening people's eyes to what is happening in their communities. She stated that if the Commission were interested they would come out and provide a group training on hate crimes. She further stated they have a phenomenal power point presentation. They have symbol brochures. She reported that many neighborhoods are receiving fliers with hateful propaganda.

Mr. Kelly stated that they have had ongoing concerns with the Police Department. He further stated there has been an ongoing issue with the Phoenix Police Department where a motorcycle cop will sit around the corner from a gay bar and regardless if someone is drinking or just dropping someone off he will pull them over for whatever reason and harass that individual because he or she left a gay bar. This officer has pulled over 50 people in a short amount of time. Their community has suggested training on how to deal with same sex partners on domestic violence. The argument was that it would bring up the issue of outing someone that is not out to his or her family. He remarked the issue is that they need to communicate with and educate the Police Department. He further remarked the problem in Scottsdale is that there is not a Council person targeted for one area that could assist him.

Chair Tutelman reminded the Commission that they have a motion on the floor to hold a special meeting to discuss the status of the hate crimes. He called for the vote.

The motion passed by a vote of six (6) to zero (0).

Mr. Kelly stated that he felt it was important that the Police Department and Mayor take this hate crime against these two women seriously. Vice Chairman Culver stated that he felt the Police Chief is taking this issue very seriously and the investigation is going well. He further stated that this Commission is very interested. He reported that this will be the first major test to see if our new Chief and Detective handle this case properly. He further reported that his only concern is that the person has not been picked up yet. Chairman Tutelman stated he felt the new Police Chief and Detective job performance has done a 180-degree change.

The Commission came up with the following list of questions for the dialogue they will have with the Chief at the special meeting:

- Why no arrest.

- Why did the victim make contact with the Phoenix Police Department instead of the Scottsdale Police Department.
- What is the Police Departments view on hate crimes.
- Like to see in writing Scottsdale Police Department policy on investigating and identifying hate crimes.
- What is the Police Department measured on and where these kinds of incidence fall into that?
- How much of Detective Nichols time is allocated to hate crimes?
- Is the Police Department Planning on training its officers on hate crimes, gender identification etc.?
- Why did Detective Nichols take two weeks to inquire at the Rogue?
- Does the Scottsdale Police Department provide a venue for its diverse community an advisory board? If so when does it meet?
- What is the Scottsdale Police Department perception of how they respond?
- Where is the information sharing with the community? Why should the residents have to sue to get information?
- Why didn't the Scottsdale Police Department work with Anti Defamation League?

Dr. McMillan stated if they have any other questions to email them to her and she would add them to the list.

Commissioner Tyler stated that when the Commission was originally formed it became a Commission that was uniquely directed at the Police Department. He further stated that they need to focus on the entire city and not just the Police Department.

Chair Tutelman stated the ADL has volunteered to provide hate crime training for the Commission. He suggested they setup a date and time. It was determine the training would be held on July 12, 2004 at 8:00 a.m.

PROMOTING UNITY IN THE COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIP PROGRAM

Dr. McMillan provided examples of the proposed marketing materials for the SHRC Promoting Unity in the Community Partnership Program for the Commission's review.

Commissioner Strickstein commented that he felt the brochure was busy. Dr. McMillan replied when they make it bigger it would not be as busy.

REVIEW VALLEY-WIDE HRC PSA INITIATIVE

Chair Tutelman reported that he attended the Valley-Wide HRC meeting in Tempe. He further reported the main topic was the PSA. Each of the Valley Commissions' voted and chose their top three purposes for the PSA as listed below:

- Let public know what the HRC is and does – increase awareness.
- Promote tolerance, diversity, and unity
- Educate – Present a positive image of what diversity and unity are.

He stated the group suggested they use photos from the Unity Walk in the PSA. He further stated that he would put together something new and different for the PSA. He noted that the group wanted the PSA put together in 90 days for their review. He further noted that it was suggested they hold a August meeting to review the PSA. He reported that Chandler has volunteer to host the meeting if Scottsdale is unable to.

He provided a brief recap of the Valley Wide HRC meeting.

CHAIR REPORTS

Chair Tutelman reported that Tempe has chosen February 5, 2005 as the date for the Unity Walk. He further reported that Phoenix has committed to participate this year in the Unity Walk.

COMMISSION ITEMS

Commissioner Tyler invited the Anti Defamation League back to provide the Commission with an overview of their organization. Chair Tutelman suggested the ADL provide a history of their organization at the hate crime training session.

Commissioner Strickstein passed out information on the Camp CEO program for young girls. He also presented a newspaper article from the Republic regarding statistics about almost half of the US is likely to be minorities by the year 2050.

OPEN CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Ms. Twitchell extended a note of thanks on this informative meeting. She remarked that she felt the City of Scottsdale does cares and are going to get things done.

Mr. Kelly stated that as a citizen of Scottsdale he is grateful for this forum. He further stated that they have answered his concerns that the city is serious about what is going.

STAFF LIAISON ITEMS

Dr. McMillan passed out a copy of the City Council priorities.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Commission, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting was adjourned at 7:38 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

“For the Record” Court Reporters.